



STATE OF RHODE ISLAND
INTER-DEPARTMENTAL MEMORANDUM

Date: December 18, 2024

To: Max Righter
Administrator of Purchasing Systems
Department of Administration
Division of Purchases

From: Steven Chybowski
Administrator, Energy Efficiency Programs
Office of Energy Resources

Subject: **Evaluation of Technical Proposals Submitted in Response to QLV # 24003654 – OER Phase 1 State of Rhode Island Energy Efficiency Program Administration**

Request for Qualified List of Vendors

Below is the Technical Evaluation of QLV # 24003654 – OER Phase 1 State of Rhode Island Energy Efficiency Program Administration. After careful evaluation and scoring of the submitted technical proposals, the evaluation team requests to invite the following vendors to the next phase in the solicitation process:

1. The Narragansett Electric Company d/b/a Rhode Island Energy
2. VEIC

Overview:

Please find enclosed a copy of the Technical Evaluation for the proposals that were submitted in response to QLV # 24003654 – OER Phase 1 State of Rhode Island Energy Efficiency Program Administration.

There were four (4) proposals to the State’s energy efficiency program administration covered by this request from:

1. The Narragansett Electric Company d/b/a Rhode Island Energy
2. VEIC
3. InClime, Inc.
4. TRC, Engineers LLC

The technical proposals were received by the Technical Review Committee on or before April 3, 2024. The proposals were reviewed by a predetermined Technical Review Committee.

The Technical Review Committee finds that The Narragansett Electric Company d/b/a Rhode Island Energy and the VEIC proposals meet the technical threshold set forth in the QLV # 24003654 – OER Phase 1 State of Rhode Island Energy Efficiency Program Administration.

QLV #24003654 Bid Evaluation Team Detailed Report

Contents

I. Technical Review Committee Information.....	3
II. Vendor Proposals Reviewed.....	Error! Bookmark not defined.
III. Technical Proposal Scoring Process and Recommendations:	3
Appendix A. Technical Review Committee Master Scores.....	5

I. Technical Review Committee Information

A Technical Review Committee reviewed the bidder responses to the RFP QLV # 24003654 – OER Phase 1 State of Rhode Island Energy Efficiency Program Administration. The Committee was comprised of the following individuals:

Name	Department	Title
Steven Chybowski	Office of Energy Resources	Administrator, Energy Efficiency Programs
Karen Bradbury	Office of Energy Resources	Administrator, Energy Legislation and Programs
William Owen	Office of Energy Resources	Energy Policy Regulatory Manager
Sarah Doherty	Office of Energy Resources	Thermal Decarbonization Manager

Additionally, the following individuals participated in the process serving as advisory members to the Technical Review Committee:

Name	Organization	Role
Stephan Wollenburg	Sustainable Energy Advantage, LLC	OER Technical Consultant
Peter Gill Case	Energy Efficiency and Resource Management Council	Energy Design and Code Representative
Priscilla De La Cruz	Energy Efficiency and Resource Management Council	Residential Representative
Craig Johnson	Optimal Energy	EERMC Technical Consultant

The Technical Review Committee and advisory members met on the following date(s):

Meeting #	Date and Time	Place
1	Wednesday, May 29, 2024 @ 10:00-1:00PM ET	DOA, Accounts and Controls Conference Room
2	Tuesday, June 25, 2024 @ 10:00-1:00PM ET	DOA, Accounts and Controls Conference Room and Remote

II. Vendor Proposals Reviewed

The following Vendors submitted responsive proposal packages that were reviewed by the Committee:

Vendor Name
The Narragansett Electric Company d/b/a Rhode Island Energy
VEIC
InClime, Inc.
TRC, Engineers LLC

III. Technical Proposal Scoring Process and Recommendations:

Scoring Process:

Each member of the Technical Review Committee and its advisory members conducted a thorough, independent evaluation of each proposal. The Committee and its advisory members each independently reviewed the proposals before discussing with other members. The Committee held an initial meeting to discuss scores on May 29, 2024, and held a subsequent meeting on June 25, 2024. At these meetings, each Committee Member was provided with an opportunity to share their evaluation of each proposal. After Committee Members shared proposed scoring, the Committee and its advisory members discussed and debated scores for Technical Proposal Category for each bidder. The scores included below reflect consensus reached by the Committee and its advisory members.

OER's Technical Consultant developed a grading rubric to assist in the development of scores. The rubric identified key elements for each of the technical proposal categories, based on information sought in the QLV. The rubric enabled the user to select a numerical score for each element, with a description for each score by each element intended to assist in consistent scoring. The grading rubric was provided to individual Committee members for their use in helping to develop the ultimate scores for each category (i.e., Staff Qualifications, Capability, Capacity, and Qualifications of the Vendor, and Work Plan).

Per the QLV, to be invited for an interview, a bidder's technical proposal must receive a minimum of 75 out of 90 points. Consensus scoring of the technical proposals yielded two vendors, The Narragansett Electric Company d/b/a Rhode Island Energy and VEIC, that exceeded this threshold. In advance of the interviews, the Committee developed an interview guide. Interviews were held on November 13 (VEIC) and November 22 (Rhode Island Energy) with all Committee Members, including advisory members, in attendance. Following the interviews, Committee Members and advisory members provided individual scores of the interview; these scores served as the basis of the overall interview score.

Per the QLV, bidders must receive a minimum Phase 1 score of 85 (technical proposal plus interview) in order to advance to Phase 2. Rhode Island Energy and VEIC both met this threshold.

Details on each proposal scoring and findings are referenced in the following Appendix A.

Appendix A. Technical Review Committee Master Scores

The Narragansett Electric Company d/b/a Rhode Island Energy		
Technical Proposal Category	Consensus Score	Notes
Staff Qualifications <i>(0 – 10 points)</i>	8.9	Extensive experience administering programs in Rhode Island, but not in other jurisdictions. Less demonstrated qualifications in categories including workforce development and equity-focused programming.
Capability, Capacity, and Qualifications of the Vendor <i>(0 - 40 points)</i>	37.5	Demonstrated capabilities in Rhode Island. Less demonstrated qualifications on topics including information management and program innovation.
Work Plan <i>(0 - 40 points)</i>	31.8	Work plan demonstrated clear understanding of delivering energy efficiency in Rhode Island. Failed to articulate strategy for market transformation.
Interview <i>(0 - 10 points)</i>	7	Demonstrated commitment to delivering programs that benefit Rhode Islanders and showed collaboration with vendors. Lacked articulation of how plans may evolve and improve in the future.
Total Score	85.2	

VEIC		
Technical Proposal Category	Consensus Score	Notes
Staff Qualifications	10	Exceptional experience delivering services across

<i>(0 – 10 points)</i>		many jurisdictions. Include staff specializing in topics of interest (e.g., workforce development, stakeholder communication, etc.).
Capability, Capacity, and Qualifications of the Vendor <i>(0 - 40 points)</i>	38.6	Experience managing comparable, complex programs in multiple jurisdictions makes capabilities evident. Less detail on approach to working with subcontractors.
<i>Work Plan</i> <i>(0 - 40 points)</i>	35	Work plan signals understanding of RI and provides vision of how vendor believe programs can and should be improved. Several portions of the plan were compelling, though unclear how tailored they were to RI. Discussed transition, though had less detail on some specific topics (e.g., working with existing subcontractors).
Interview <i>(0 - 10 points)</i>	9	Impressive set of individuals, excellent coordination within VEIC and with their proposed partner, Abode, clearly defined roles, clear, specific responses to all questions.
Total Score	92.6	

InClime, Inc.		
Technical Proposal Category	Consensus Score	Notes
Staff Qualifications (0 – 10 points)	5.6	Limited experience delivering complex energy efficiency programs. Staff from partner, GDS, had more energy efficiency experience, but GDS appears to have limited role. No mention of working with disadvantaged communities, minimal workforce development references.
Capability, Capacity, and Qualifications of the Vendor (0 - 40 points)	30.8	Excellent qualifications for items such as information management, EM&V, and building codes. Less demonstrated capacity on some key items, e.g., managing subcontractors, promoting participation in programs, and being accountable to regulators for achieving program goals.
Work Plan (0 - 40 points)	19.4	Strong in areas that appear to be Bidder’s core competencies (e.g., information management), but either does not address or does not provide clear plan for key components (e.g., the programs and strategies for achieving savings themselves, plan to collaborate with distribution planning, and public awareness)
Interview (0 - 10 points)	Did not qualify	N/A
Total Score	55.8	

TRC, Engineers LLC		
Technical Proposal Category	Consensus Score	Notes
Staff Qualifications <i>(0 – 10 points)</i>	8.9	Impressive set of staff operating diverse programs across many jurisdictions. Limited discussion of stakeholder management in role of program administrator (as opposed to implementer).
Capability, Capacity, and Qualifications of the Vendor <i>(0 - 40 points)</i>	33.5	Bidder cites experience across all key core functions, in the context of large programs. Some qualifications based on work as implementer in a slightly different role than envisioned in RI.
Work Plan <i>(0 - 40 points)</i>	18.5	A reasonable work plan for energy efficiency in general, but proposed work plan lacks discussion of RI context.
Interview <i>(0 - 10 points)</i>	Did not qualify	N/A
Total Score	60.9	